Received: 2003.07.14
Accepted: 2003.09.02
Published: 2003.11.03

Authors' Contribution:
A Study Design
B Data Collection
C Statistical Analysis
D Data Interpretation
E Manuscript Preparation
F Literature Search
G Funds Collection

# Educational attainment and risk of stroke and myocardial infarction 

Adnan I. Qureshi ${ }^{1,2}$, M. Fareed K. Suri ${ }^{1}$, Mustafa Saad ${ }^{\mathbf{1}}$, L. Nelson Hopkins ${ }^{\mathbf{1}}$<br>${ }^{1}$ Department of Neurosurgery and Toshiba Stroke Research Center, School of Medicine and Biomedical Sciences, University at Buffalo, State University of New York, Buffalo, NY, U.S.A.<br>${ }^{2}$ Department of Neurology and Neurosciences, University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey, Newark, NJ, U.S.A.<br>Source of support: none.

## Summary

| Background: | Prior reports have suggested that low educational attainment could be associated with higher <br> incidence of some of the cardiovascular conditions. <br> Material/Methods: <br> We evaluated the association of educational attainment ( $\geqslant 12$ years or < 12 years) with the <br> incidence of fatal strokes, ischemic stroke, intracerebral hemorrhage, and myocardial infarc- <br> tion in a cohort of 21,443 United States adults who participated in either the First National <br> Health and Nutrition Examination Survey (NHANES-I) Epidemiologic Follow-up Study <br> (NHEFS) or the Second National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey Mortality Follow-- <br> up Study (NHANES-II). Cox proportional hazards analyses were used to examine the rela- <br> tionships. |
| :---: | :--- |
| Results: | During a mean follow-up period of 15.2 $\pm 4.6$ years, the risk for all fatal strokes was increased <br> in persons who reported less than 12 years of education. The increased risk was more promi- <br> nent in persons aged 50 years or less (relative risk [RR], 2.6; 95\% confidence interval [CI], <br> 1.1-6.0) compared with persons aged greater than 50 years (RR, 1.3, 95\% CI, 1.0-1.6). A <br> higher risk of myocardial infarction associated with less than 12 years of education was <br> observed in both persons aged 50 years or less (RR 1.7, 95\% CI 1.2-2.4) and those aged <br> greater than 50 years (RR 1.3, 95\% CI 1.1-1.5). The risk for fatal intracerebral hemorrhages <br> (RR 2.0, 95\% CI 1.1-3.5) was higher in persons with less than 12 years of education (no signif- <br> icant interaction demonstrated with age). |
| Conclusions: | Educational attainment has a significant effect on the risk for stroke and myocardial infarc- <br> tion, independent of socioeconomic status and other cardiovascular risk factors. |

key words:
educational attainment • stroke, myocardial infarction - cardiovascular risk factors • epidemiologic studies

## Full-text PDF:

http://www.MedSciMonit.com/pub/vol_9/no_11/3975.pdf
Word count:
2995
Tables:
5
Figures:
References:
32

## Author's address:

Adnan I. Qureshi MD, Neurological Institute of New Jersey, 90 Bergen Street, DOC-8100, Newark, NJ 07103, U.S.A., email: aiqureshi@hotmail.com

## BACKGROUND

Cardiovascular disease was responsible for 618,289 deaths in the United States in 1998. It is estimated that $1,100,000$ persons will have a myocardial infarction and 600,000 persons will suffer from a stroke in the year 2002 [1]. Given the continuing high incidence of cardiovascular disease, the identification of new predisposing risk factors, especially those that can be modified, is of paramount importance. Social conditions have been implicated in influencing the risk of cardiovascular disease [2-5]. We had previously observed that educational attainment explained in part the differences in the risk of intracerebral hemorrhage in white and AfricanAmerican populations [6]. In the present study, our purpose was to examine the contribution of educational attainment to the long-term risk of cardiovascular disease.

## Material and Methods

## Study Design and Objectives

We used the pooled data of two national cohorts, the First National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey (NHANES I) Epidemiologic Follow-up Study (NHEFS) and the Second National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey (NHANES II) Mortality Follow-up Study, to determine the effect of educational attainment on the long-term risk of stroke and its subtypes and myocardial infarction [7-10]. The National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey follow-up studies provide cohort data on a large nationally representative sample of the United States population, which presents a unique opportunity for identification of undefined cardiovascular risk factors within the United States population.

## NHEFS (NHANES I Epidemiologic Follow-up Study)

NHANES I was conducted by the National Center for Health Statistics, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, from 1971 through 1975 to collect healthrelated information on a probability sample of the United States civilian, non-institutionalized population. To increase the sample size in select subgroups, the elderly, persons living in poverty areas, and women of childbearing age were oversampled [11-13]. The objective of the NHEFS was to provide follow-up of the 14,407 examinees in NHANES I who were between the ages of 25 and 74 years at the time of the baseline survey [7]. Data collection for this analysis included tracing all NHANES I participants for morbidity and mortality through 1992 [7,9,14]. Events of ischemic stroke, intracerebral hemorrhage, and myocardial infarction were determined by death certificate diagnoses that included one or more of the following International Classification of Diseases Clinical Modification (ICD-9 CM) codes: 433, 434, 436, 437.0, or 437.1 (for ischemic stroke), 431 to 432 (for intracerebral hemorrhage), and 410 to 414 (for myocardial infarction).

## NHANES II Mortality Follow-up Study

The baseline survey of NHANES II was conducted between 1976 and 1980 for a national probability sample of 20,322 persons aged 6 months to 74 years $[8,10]$. The basic purpose, design, and procedures were similar, with slight modifications, to those of NHANES I. Mortality fol-low-up was conducted for the cohort of 9252 NHANES II participants who were aged 30 years or older at the time of enrollment. The vital status of each participant was ascertained by matching data obtained from NHANES II with deaths recorded in the National Death Index, which has been shown to accurately record 93 to 98 percent of all deaths [15-17] and the Social Security Administration Death Master File [8]. Information obtained for the Mortality Follow-up Study included the month and year in which an individual was last known to be alive and the ICD-9 CM code for the underlying cause of death. The vital status of each cohort member through December 31, 1992 was obtained. The duration of followup (i.e, survival time) for each participant was calculated as the difference between the NHANES II baseline examination date and the last known date alive obtained from the NHANES II Mortality Study. The cause of death was available through death certificate diagnosis using the above-mentioned ICD-9 CM codes.

## Pooled NHEFS and NHANES II Mortality Followup Study data

The two national health surveys had similar sampling and data collection methods. The cardiovascular risk factors analyzed in the pooled data included age, blood pressure measurements, serum cholesterol levels, cigarette smoking status, and presence of diabetes, and these data were obtained in both surveys. For NHEFS, three blood pressure readings were available for $48 \%$ of participants and one blood pressure reading was available for $52 \%$ of participants at baseline evaluation. For NHANES II Mortality Follow-up Study, three blood pressure readings were available for $99 \%$ of the participants at baseline evaluation. The last blood pressure measurement made was used whenever more than one measurement was available. The sex- and race/ethnicity-specific operating characteristics curves of the NHANES I and NHANES II cohorts were nearly identical in a previous report, which suggested that the demographic characteristics of these persons were equivalent [18]. Data from the two cohorts were combined to increase the size of the sample in the present study. Educational attainment was available at baseline for each national cohort and was categorized into the following two response choices on the basis of self reports of years of education: less than 12 years, or equal to or more than 12 years.

## Statistical Analysis

Persons who reported a history of stroke or myocardial infarction during the baseline NHANES I and II surveys were excluded from statistical analysis in our study. Because the interval of follow-up varied among individuals, Cox proportional hazards analyses were used to estimate the relative risks ( RR ) and 95 percent confidence

Table 1. Demographic and clinical characteristics of participants according to educational attainment.

| Characteristic |  | Educational attainment <12 years | Educational attainment $\geqslant 12$ years |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Age | Mean $\pm$ SD | $56.2 \pm 13.6^{*}$ | $46.6 \pm 14.3$ |
| Gender | Male | 4085 (44\%) | 5006 (41\%) |
|  | Female | 5138 (56\%)* | 7214 (59\%) |
| Race/ethnicity | White | 7259 (79\%) | 11109 (91\%) |
|  | African-American | 1855 (20\%)* | 944 (8\%) |
|  | Other | 109 (1\%) | 167 (1\%) |
| Systolic blood pressure | mm Hg | $140 \pm 25 *$ | $130 \pm 21$ |
| Diabetes mellitus |  | 526 (6\%)* | 327 (3\%) |
| Body mass index | $\mathrm{kg} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$ | $26.5 \pm 5.4^{*}$ | $25.3 \pm 4.7$ |
| Serum cholesterol | $\mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{dl}$ | $227 \pm 50$ * | $218 \pm 47$ |
| Socioeconomic status | Poverty index < 1 | 2106 (23\%)* | 577 (5\%) |
| Smoking | Current | 2333 (25\%) | 3338 (27\%) |
|  | Previous | 2493 (27\%) | 3245 (27\%) |
|  | Never | 3768 (41\%) | 5044 (41\%) |
|  | Missing | 629 (7\%) | 593 (5\%) |
| Income per year | <10,000 | 6422 (70\%) | 4073 (33\%) |
|  | 10,000-20,000 | 1957 (21\%)* | 4977 (41\%) |
|  | >20,000 | 479 (5\%)* | 2764 (23\%) |
|  | Missing | 365 (4\%)* | 406 (3\%) |

*Significant difference according to analysis of variance (ANOVA) for means or chi-square test for frequencies
intervals (CI) for all strokes, ischemic stroke, intracerebral hemorrhage, and myocardial infarction among persons with 12 or more years of education and those with less than 12 years of education. Potential confounding factors considered in the analyses included age, sex, race/ethnicity (African American, white, or other), systolic blood pressure, presence of diabetes mellitus, serum cholesterol level, smoking status, body mass index (weight in $\mathrm{kg} /$ height in m2), and socioeconomic status. Diabetes mellitus was determined by self-report. The presence of diabetes mellitus was determined by self-report during a standardized interview at baseline evaluation. Smoking status was categorized as current, previous, never, and undetermined. Socioeconomic status was expressed as poverty index. Poverty index was computed as a ratio of two components [19]. The numerator was the midpoint of the observed family income category. The denominator is the product of the following: [(daily cost for food per person for the specific year x number of family members) x number of days in that year] x 3 . The daily cost for food is adjusted annually and it is assumed that onethird of the income will be spent on food. The poverty index allowed income data to be analyzed in a comparable manner across the years of these surveys and previous surveys. A higher poverty index suggests higher income and economic status. Poverty index was categorized as less than 1 or greater than or equal to 1 , with values less than 1 designating poor. Systolic blood pressure, bodymass index, and serum cholesterol level were entered in the model as continuous variables.

Interactions between variables entered in the models were tested. The only significant interaction observed
was between age and educational attainment in the models for fatal myocardial infarction, stroke, and ischemic stroke. The results were therefore analyzed in two strata of age based on the median age of the population. The strata were greater than 50 years and less than or equal to 50 years. No significant interactions were demonstrated in the models after stratification by age.

The mean follow-up period for the combined cohort was $15.2 \pm 4.6$ years. The mean follow-up period for NHANES I cohort was longer than the NHANES II cohorts ( $16.4 \pm 5.0$ years versus $13.5 \pm 3.5$ years, $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ ). We tested for any interaction induced by participation in either cohort on the effect of education on cardiovascular endpoints in each of the models. There was no interaction demonstrated suggesting homogeneity of effect between the two cohorts.

## Results

Follow-up data were available for 22,838 participants, consisting of 13,586 enrolled in the NHEFS and 9252 enrolled in the NHANES II Mortality Follow-up Study. Of the 22,838 participants, 1220 persons were excluded because a history of stroke or myocardial infarction was reported at the time of baseline evaluation, and 175 persons were excluded because the educational status was not available. A total of 21,443 participants were included in the final analysis. The mean age was $50.8 \pm 14.8$ years; 9091 were men.

Compared with persons who had 12 or more years of education, those who had less than 12 years of education were more likely to be older and have higher systolic blood pressure and diabetes mellitus (Table 1). A higher proportion of African-Americans and diabetics were observed in the group with less than 12 years of education. Mean values for serum cholesterol level and body mass index were higher in persons with less than 12 years of education. Educational attainment of less than 12 years was associated with lower socioeconomic status (poverty index $<1$ ). The proportion of persons with higher annual income was significantly lower among those with educational attainment of less than 12 years. To determine the effect of education on access to health care, we analyzed the association between educational attainment and self-reported visit to physician's office within the last 5 months. The data was only available for a subset of participants $(\mathrm{n}=6505)$. The proportion of patients with physician's office visit within the last 5 months was not different among persons with less than 12 years of education compared with persons with 12 or more years of education (1197 of 2992 versus 1452 of 3513 persons, $\mathrm{p}=0.3$ ).

In the follow-up period, a total of 5693 deaths were observed of which 409 were fatal stroke events and 1527 were fatal myocardial infarctions. A comparison of the frequency of major causes of death among persons according to educational attainment is provided in Table 2. Among the fatal stroke events, 344 were classified as ischemic strokes and 65 were classified as intracerebral hemorrhages.

Table 2. Causes of death among the participants according to educational attaitment.

|  | Education $<12$ years Education $\geqslant 12$ years $(\mathrm{n}=9223) \quad(\mathrm{n}=12220)$ |  |  |  | OR (95\% CI)* |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| All causes | 3546 | (38\%) | 2147 | (18\%) | 2.9 | (2.8-3.2) |
| All cardiovascular diseases (390-398, 402,404-429, 430-438) | 1664 | (18\%) | 893 | (7\%) | 2.8 | (2.6-3.0) |
| Ischemic heart disease (410-414) | 990 | (11\%) | 537 | (4\%) | 2.6 | (2.3-2.9) |
| Stroke (431-437) | 280 | (3\%) | 129 | (1\%) | 2.9 | (2.4-3.6) |
| Malignant neoplasms (140-208) | 850 | (9\%) | 647 | (5\%) | 1.8 | (1.6-2.0) |
| Chronic obstructive pulmonary diseases and allied conditions (490-496) | 158 | (2\%) | 91 | (1\%) | 2.3 | (1.8-3.0) |
| Accidents and adverse effects (E800-E949) | 28 | (0.3\%) | 30 | (0.5\%) | 1.2 | (0.8-2.1) |
| Pneumonia and influenza (480-487) | 125 | (1.3\%) | 60 | (0.5\%) | 2.8 | (2.0-3.8) |
| Diabetes mellitus (250) | 75 | (0.8\%) | 39 | (0.3\%) | 2.6 | (1.8-3.8) |
| Human immunodeficiency virus infection (042-044) |  | - |  | - |  | - |
| Suicide (E950-E959) |  | 1 |  | - |  | - |
| Chronic liver disease (571) | 41 | (0.4\%) | 26 | (0.2\%) | 2.1 | (1.3-3.4) |
| All other causes | 604 | (7\%) | 361 | (3\%) | 2.3 | (2.0-2.6) |

OR - Odd ratio; Cl - Confidence interval.
Symbols used: *- derived from chi-square test.
ICD-9 CM codes are provided with cause of death

Table 3. Effect of educational attainment on risk for all fatal strokes, fatal ischemic strokes, and fatal intracerebral hemorrhage in the pooled analysis of the First National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey Epidemiologic Follow-up Study and the Second National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey Mortality Follow-up Study.

|  | Sample size |  | rate | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \text { Age-adjusted } \\ & \text { RR (95\% CI) } \end{aligned}$ | Multivariate adjusted RR (95\% CI) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| All strokes |  |  |  |  |  |
| Age $\leqslant 50$ years |  |  |  |  |  |
| Educational attainment $\geqslant 12$ years | 7450 | 10 | (0.1\%) | Reference | Reference |
| Educational attainment <12 years | 3034 | 20 | (0.7\%) | 4.1 (1.9-8.8) | 2.6 (1.1-6.0) |
| Age > 50 years |  |  |  |  |  |
| Educational attainment $\geqslant 12$ years | 4770 | 119 | (2.5\%) | Reference | Reference |
| Educational attainment $<12$ years | 6189 | 260 | (4.2\%) | 1.4 (1.2-1.8) | 1.3 (1.0-1.6) |
| Ischemic strokes |  |  |  |  |  |
| Age $\leqslant 50$ years |  |  |  |  |  |
| Educational attainment $\geqslant 12$ years | 7450 | 5 | (0.1\%) | Reference | Reference |
| Educational attainment <12 years | 3034 | 14 | (0.5\%) | 5.3 (1.9-14.8) | 2.6 (0.8-8.1) |
| Age $>50$ years |  |  |  |  |  |
| Educational attainment $\geqslant 12$ years | 4770 | 104 | (2.2\%) | Reference | Reference |
| Educational attainment <12 years | 6189 | 221 | (3.6\%) | 1.4 (1.1-1.8) | 1.2 (0.9-1.6) |
| Intracerebral hemorrhage |  |  |  |  |  |
| All ages |  |  |  |  |  |
| Educational attainment $\geqslant 12$ years | 12220 | 20 | (0.2\%) | Reference | Reference |
| Educational attainment <12 years | 9223 | 45 | (0.5\%) | 2.0 (1.2-3.7) | 2.0 (1.1-3.5) |

Analyses in Table 3 were conducted after adjusting for age, sex, race/ethnicity, systolic blood pressure, diabetes mellitus, serum cholesterol level, smoking status, body mass index (weight in $\mathrm{kg} /$ height in $\mathrm{m}^{2}$ ), and socioeconomic status.
RR - relative risk; Cl - confidence interval

Compared with persons with 12 or more years of education, those with less than 12 years of education were at significantly higher risk for all fatal strokes after adjusting for other confounding factors. The increased risk was more prominent in persons aged 50 years or less (RR, 2.6; $95 \%$ CI, 1.1-6.0) compared with persons aged greater than 50 years (RR, 1.3, 95\% CI, 1.0-1.6) (Table 3). For persons aged 50 years or less, the relative risk of fatal ischemic stroke was 2.6 times higher among persons with less than 12 years of education compared with those with 12 or more years of education, but this difference
did not achieve statistical significance. The risk for fatal intracerebral hemorrhages (RR 2.0, 95\% CI 1.1-3.5) was higher in persons with less than 12 years of education (no significant interaction demonstrated with age). Persons with less than 12 years of education were at a significantly higher risk for fatal myocardial infarction than those with 12 or more years of education (Table 4) after adjusting for other confounding factors. A higher risk of myocardial infarction was observed in both persons aged 50 years or less (RR 1.7, 95\% CI 1.2-2.4) and those aged greater than 50 years (RR 1.3, 95\% CI 1.1-1.5).

Table 4. Effect of educational attainment on risk for all fatal myocardial infarction in the pooled analysis of the First National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey Epidemiologic Follow-up Study and the Second National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey Mortality Follow-up Study.

|  | Sample size | Event rate | Age-adjusted <br> $\mathbf{R R} \mathbf{( 9 5 \% ~ \mathbf { C l } )}$ | Multivariate adjusted <br> $\mathbf{R R ~ ( 9 5 \% ~ \mathbf { C I } )}$ |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Age $\leqslant \mathbf{5 0}$ year |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Educational attainment $\geqslant 12$ years | 7450 | 76 | $(1.0 \%)$ | Reference | Reference |  |
| Educational attainment $<12$ years | 3034 | 72 | $(2.4 \%)$ | 1.9 | $(1.4-2.6)$ | 1.7 |
| Age $>50$ years |  |  |  |  | $(1.2-2.4)$ |  |
| Educational attainment $\geqslant 12$ years | 4770 | 461 | $(9.7 \%)$ | Reference | Reference |  |
| Educational attainment $<12$ years | 6189 | 918 | $(14.9 \%)$ | 1.4 | $(1.3-1.6)$ | 1.3 |

Analyses in Table 4 were conducted after adjusting for age, sex, race/ethnicity, systolic blood pressure, diabetes mellitus, serum cholesterol level, smoking status, body mass index (weight in kg/height in $\mathrm{m}^{2}$ ), and socioeconomic status.
RR - relative risk; Cl - confidence interval

## DISCUSSION

## Salient Findings of the Study

In our analysis using pooled data from two national cohorts, we observed that persons who reported attaining less than 12 years of education were at higher risk for fatal stroke and myocardial infarction than those who reported 12 or more years of education. The increased risk was independent of age, sex, race/ethnicity, systolic blood pressure, diabetes mellitus, cigarette smoking, serum cholesterol level, body mass index, and socioeconomic status. The effect of education on myocardial infarction and stroke was not consistent through out all age groups and appeared to be more prominent in persons aged 50 years or less. When analysis was performed according to stroke subtype, an increased risk was observed for intracerebral hemorrhage among persons with educational attainment less than 12 years. Our results strongly suggest that educational attainment may affect an individual's risk for developing cardiovascular diseases and that this risk is independent of previously defined cardiovascular risk factors.

## Review of Previous Studies

The role of educational attainment as a risk factor for cardiovascular disease has been evaluated in selected populations. Table 5 provides a summary of pertinent studies [3,4,20-25]. It should be noted that most studies performed in United States are representative of men. Our study population includes appropriate representation of women and other ethnic populations in proportions similar to population of United States. Therefore, the study design is less likely to be biased by factors specific to certain geographic sites or organizations that limit the generalization of the derived results. Our study also provides data on the effect of educational attainment on stroke and stroke subtypes, which has not been reported previously. Hinkle et al. [3] reported the results of a 5-year prospective survey evaluating the relationships among occupation, education, and coronary artery disease in 270,000 men employed by the Bell System Operating Companies. These investigators observed that men who entered the organization with a college degree had lower rates of heart attack, death,
and disability related to coronary artery disease. Liu et al. [4] studied the relationship of education to cardiovascular risk factors at baseline and long-term mortality from coronary artery and cardiovascular diseases in three cohorts of middle-aged white men employed in Chicago. An inverse relationship was observed between education and blood pressure status. Furthermore, an inverse relationship was observed between cigarette smoking status and level of education. A subset analysis of 8047 men demonstrated a graded inverse relationship between education and age-adjusted mortality rates from coronary artery and cardiovascular diseases in the 21-year follow-up period. These associations were statistically significant, although less so after adjustments for other cardiovascular risk factors such as systolic blood pressure and smoking were made. Low educational attainment has been identified as a risk factor for stroke in other studies [20,26,27]. Siegel et al. [20] analyzed data from the Systolic Hypertension in the Elderly Program pilot project. A total of 551 men and women 60 years of age and older with pretreatment systolic blood pressure greater than or equal to 160 mmHg and diastolic blood pressure less than 90 mmHg were prospectively studied, and the incidence of cardiovascular events and death was determined. In the multivariate analysis, age, lower level of education, history of a cardiovascular event, and cigarette smoking were significant predictors of a cardiovascular event.

## Underlying Mechanism for Association Between Educational Attainment and Cardiovascular Diseases

The underlying mechanism by which persons with lower educational attainment are at higher risk for cardiovascular diseases is not fully understood. In our study, the increased risk was observed for fatal stroke, intracerebral hemorrhage, and myocardial infarction. Educational attainment is an important risk factor for cigarette smoking and the development of hypertension, obesity, and high levels of serum cholesterol. In our study and that by Liu et al. [4] the increased risk of cardiovascular diseases was independent of other cardiovascular risk factors. Moreover, in our study, cardiovascular disease risk was also independent of socioeconomic status. Persons of lower socioeconomic status are

Table 5. Summary of pertinent studies that have evaluated the effect of educational attainment on cardiovascular disease.

| Study | Study population | Design | Educational attainment categories | Potential confounders in multivariate model | Results |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { Hinkle et al. [3] } \\ & \text { (1968) } \end{aligned}$ | Bell systems employed men ( $\mathrm{n}=269,755$ ) aged $35-59$ years | Retrospective analysis of cohort (3 year follow-up) | College education | None | Lower rate of CHD among college educated |
| $\begin{aligned} & \hline \text { Liu et al. [4] } \\ & \text { (1982) } \end{aligned}$ | CHA ( $n=8047$ ) <br> Men aged 40-59 years | Prospective cohort (5 year follow-up) | High school graduate, some college, college graduate | Age, DBP, cigarette smoking, cholesterol, weight, ECG | Graded inverse relationship between CVD mortality |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { Liu et al. [4] } \\ & \text { (1982) } \end{aligned}$ | PG-WE ( $\mathrm{n}=2980$ ) <br> Men aged 40-55 years and white men aged 40-59 years | Prospective cohort (20-21 year follow-up) | High school graduate, some college, college graduate | Age, DBP, cigarette smoking, cholesterol, weight, ECG | Inverse relationship between CVD mortality but not graded |
| $\begin{aligned} & \hline \text { Siegel et al. [20] } \\ & \text { (1987) } \end{aligned}$ | SHEP pilot program ( $\mathrm{n}=551$ ). Persons with ISH aged $\geqslant 60$ years ( $82 \%$ white) | Prospective cohort (average follow up of 34 months) | High school graduate or less, some college or more | Age, sex, race, cigarette smoking, BMI, ECG, SBP, DBP, heart rate, pulse pressure, antihypertensive treatment | Education predictive of first cardiovascular event |
| Mittleman et al. [21] (1997) | Determinants of myocardial infarction study (1623 patients with MI) | Case-crossover study | Less than high school, completed high school, some college | Stratified data analysis | Risk of having MI triggered by anger declined with increasing level of education |
| Din-Dzietham et <br> al. [22] (2000) | ARIC study ( $\mathrm{n}=10,091$ ) aged 45-64 years | Cross-sectional study | Grade school, high school without graduation, high school graduation, vocational school, some college, graduate/professional school | Age, height, SBP, diastolic diameter, pulse pressure, ethnicity, gender, cigarette smoking | Direct association between increasing education and common carotid elasticity (represents early atherosclerotic changes) |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { Kilander et al. [23] } \\ & \text { (2001) } \end{aligned}$ | 50 year old men ( $\mathrm{n}=2301$ ) in Uppsala, Sweden | Prospective cohort (22-25 year follow-up) | Low ( $\leqslant 7$ years of schooling), high (high school or university) | Age, sex, SBP, DBP, serum glucose, cigarette smoking, cholesterol, triglycerides, BMI, physical activity, serum fatty acids and antioxidants | Higher risk of CVD mortality associated with low education lost in multivariate analysis |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { Jenum et al. [24] } \\ & (2001) \end{aligned}$ | Subjects aged 40 years ( $\mathrm{n}=14220$ ) in Oslo, Norway | Matched to mortality data obtained 3-10 years later | Low (person aged $\geqslant 16$ years with only 9 years of formal education) | Correlation with age adjusted mortality | Low education positively correlated with CVD mortality |
| Pitsavos et al. <br> [25] (2002) | CARDIO2000 included 750 patients with MI and 869 controls | Retrospective case-control | Not passed senior high school, no university education, university education | Age, sex, occupation, cigarette smoking, income, hypertension, diabetes, BMI, physical activity, hypercholesterolemia, family history | Higher risk of non fatal coronary syndromes in persons who have not passed senior high school |

CHA - Chicago Heart Association Detection Project; PG - Peoples Gas Company; WE - Western Electric; SHEP - Systolic hypertension in elderly program;
ARIC - Atherosclerosis Risk in Communities; CVD - cardiovascular diseases; MI - myocardial infarction; DBP - diastolic blood pressure;
ECG - electrocardiogram; SBP - systolic blood pressure; BMI - body-mass index
substantially less likely to have access to health care [27], which may also affect the risk for cardiovascular diseases. We were unable to demonstrate any difference in the proportion of patients with physician visit within the last 5 months among a subset of the present cohort. Although, it must be recognized that the frequency of physician visit is affected by variables other than access to health care such as presence and severity of medical co-morbidities. Hinkle et al. [3], proposed that observed differences in cardiovascular disease risks were not a result of the educational process itself but rather a result
of biological differences in acquired habits, such as in diet and activity, which are formed during childhood and youth and persist into adulthood. We also observed that the effect of educational attainment on myocardial infarction and stroke was more prominent in persons aged 50 years or less. This observation suggests that the adverse consequences of low educational attainment are more likely to manifest in younger age groups. In older persons, perhaps the classical risk factors have a larger impact in determining an individual's risk for cardiovascular diseases.

## Issues Related to Data Interpretation

This study is subject to a number of limitations. One limitation is the use of ICD-9 CM codes from death certificates to identify the incidence of cases of stroke and myocardial infarction. Broderick et al. [28] reported a positive-predictive value of $83 \%$ by using ICD-9-CM codes for primary diagnoses of strokes and transient ischemic attacks. Iso et al. [29] reported the validity of death certificate diagnoses of stroke and stroke types as the underlying cause of death in a sample of in-hospital deaths from the Minnesota Heart Survey. Relative to diagnoses made by physicians, positive-predictive values for death certificate diagnoses were $100 \%$ for all types of stroke, $82 \%$ for intracranial hemorrhages, and $97 \%$ for nonhemorrhagic strokes. Boyle and Dobson [30] reported a sensitivity of $79 \%$ and a positive-predictive value of $66 \%$ for hospital diagnostic coding of non-fatal myocardial infarction. Both sensitivity ( $90 \%$ ) and positive-predictive values ( $96 \%$ ) were higher than hospital abstracts for death certificate data for myocardial infarction. Probably most important, the possibility of misclassification by using ICD-9 CM diagnoses is not different between persons with educational attainment of 12 or more years and less than 12 years. Educational attainment was graded in two broad categories. Such categorization does not allow for the specific technical aspects of the knowledge that has been imparted, which precludes a detailed insight into the educational process. A further limitation is that data regarding stroke risk factors were limited to information collected during the NHANES I and II baseline interviews. Changes in risk factor status during the follow-up period were not considered. Finally, the analysis is likely to underestimate the contributions of risk factors with measurement errors such as those for blood pressure [31] and cholesterol [32]. Because of this under estimation, we may overestimate the magnitude of the adjusted differences in the risk of cardiovascular diseases according to educational attainment.

## Conclusions

Despite these limitations, this present study reports on data obtained from two large national cohorts. The present study is one of the first studies to examine the effect of educational attainment on the incidence of cardiovascular diseases including stroke and its subtypes and myocardial infarction. Our results provide evidence that educational attainment may influence an individual's long-term risk of disease, suggesting a strong effect of education on health. Further studies are required to elucidate the mechanisms by which higher educational attainment effects the risk of cardiovascular disease.

## Acknowledgments

Presented in part at the $27^{\text {th }}$ International Stroke Conference, San Antonio TX, February 7-9, 2002 as follows: Qureshi AI, Suri MFK, Saad M, Guterman LR, Hopkins LN. Educational status and risk of fatal ischemic stroke and intracerebral hemorrhage (poster presentation P163). Stroke 2002; 33: 391.

## References:

1. American Heart Association. 2001 Heart and stroke statistical update. Texas, 2000
2. Brand RJ, Rosenman RH, Sholtz RI, Friedman M: Multivariate prediction of coronary heart disease in the Western Collaborative Group Study compared to the findings of the Framingham study. Circulation 1976; 53: 348-55
3. Hinkle LE, Jr, Whitney LH, Lehman EW et al: Occupation, education, and coronary heart disease. Risk is influenced more by education and background than by occupational experiences, in the Bell System. Science 1968; 161: 238-46
4. Liu K, Cedres LB, Stamler J et al: Relationship of education to major risk factors and death from coronary heart disease, cardiovascular diseases and all causes, Findings of three Chicago epidemiologic studies. Circulation 1982; 66: 1308-14
5. Tyroler HA: The influence of socioeconomic factors on cardiovascular disease risk factor development. Prev Med 1999; 29: S36-40
6. Qureshi AI, Giles WH, Croft JB: Racial differences in the incidence of intracerebral hemorrhage: effects of blood pressure and education. Neurology 1999; 52: 1617-21
7. Cornoni-Huntley J, Barbano HE, Brody JA et al: National health and nutrition examination I-epidemiologic follow-up survey. Public Health Rep 1983; 98: 245-51
8. Loria CM, Sempos CT, Vuong C: Plan and operation of the NHANES II Mortality Study, 1992. Vital Health Stat 1 1999: 1-16
9. Madans JH, Kleinman JC, Cox CS et al: 10 years after NHANES I: report of initial followup, 1982-84. Public Health Rep 1986; 101: 465-73
10. Sempos CT, Looker AC, Gillum RE, McGee DL, Vuong CV, Johnson CL: Serum ferritin and death from all causes and cardiovascular disease: the NHANES II Mortality Study. National Health and Nutrition Examination Study. Ann Epidemiol 2000; 10: 441-48
11. National Center for Health Statistics. Plan and operation of the NHANES I Augmentation Survey of Adults 25-74 years, United States, 1974-1975. Rockville, MD: National Center for Health Statistics (HRA) 77-310. Vital Health Stat 1978; 1(10c)
12. National Center for Health Statistics. Plan and operation of the National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey, United States, 1971-1973: part B-data collection forms of the survey. Rockville, MD: US Department of Health, Education, and Welfare publication (HRA) 77-310. Vital Health Stat 1977; 1(10b)
13. National Center for Health Statistics. Plan and operation of the National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey, United States, 1971-1973: part A-development, plan, and operation. Rockville, MD: US Department of Health, Education, and Welfare publication (HRA) 77-310. Vital Health Stat 1977; 1(10a)
14. Madans JH, Cox CS, Kleinman JC et al: 10 years after NHANES I: mortality experience at initial followup, 1982-84. Public Health Rep 1986; 101: 474-81
15. Calle EE, Terrell DD: Utility of the National Death Index for ascertainment of mortality among cancer prevention study II participants. Am J Epidemiol 1993; 137: 235-41
16. Edlavitch SA, Baxter J: Comparability of mortality follow-up before and after the National Death Index. Am J Epidemiol 1988; 127: 1164-78
17. Stampfer MJ, Willett WC, Speizer FE et al: Test of the National Death Index. Am J Epidemiol 1984; 119: 837-39
18. Liao Y, McGee DL, Cooper RS: Prediction of coronary heart disease mortality in blacks and whites: pooled data from two national cohorts. Am J Cardiol 1999; 84: 31-6
19. Qureshi AI, Suri MF, Guterman LR, Hopkins LN: Ineffective secondary prevention in survivors of cardiovascular events in the US population: report from the Third National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey. Arch Intern Med 2001; 161: 1621-28
20. Siegel D, Kuller L, Lazarus NB et al: Predictors of cardiovascular events and mortality in the Systolic Hypertension in the Elderly Program pilot project. Am J Epidemiol 1987; 126: 385-99
21. Mittleman MA, Maclure M, Nachnani M, Sherwood JB, Muller JE: Educational attainment, anger, and the risk of triggering myocardial infarction onset. The Determinants of Myocardial Infarction Onset Study Investigators. Arch Intern Med 1997; 157: 769-75
22. Din-Dzietham R, Liao D, Diez-Roux A et al: Association of educational achievement with pulsatile arterial diameter change of the common carotid artery: the Atherosclerosis Risk in Communities (ARIC) Study, 1987-1992. Am J Epidemiol 2000: 152: 617-27
23. Kilander L, Berglund L, Boberg M, Vessby B, Lithell H: Education, lifestyle factors and mortality from cardiovascular disease and cancer. A 25-year follow-up of Swedish 50-year-old men. International J Epidemiol 2001; 30: 1119-26
24. Jenum AK, Stensvold I, Thelle DS: Differences in cardiovascular disease mortality and major risk factors between districts in Oslo. An ecological analysis. International J Epidemiol 2001; 30 (Suppl 1): S59-65
25. Pitsavos CE, Panagiotakos DB, Chrysohoou CA, Skoumas J, Stefanadis C, Toutouzas PK: Education and acute coronary syndromes: results from the CARDIO2000 epidemiological study. Bull WHO 2002; 80: 371-77
26. Lindenstrom E, Boysen G, Nyboe J: Risk factors for stroke in Copenhagen, Denmark. I. Basic demographic and social factors. Neuroepidemiology 1993; 12: 37-42
27. Moroney JT, Bagiella E, Tatemichi TK, Paik MC, Stern Y, Desmond DW: Dementia after stroke increases the risk of longterm stroke recurrence. Neurology 1997; 48: 1317-25
28. Broderick J, Brott T, Kothari R et al: The Greater Cincinnati/Northern Kentucky Stroke Study: preliminary first-ever and total incidence rates of stroke among blacks. Stroke 1998; 29: 415-21
29. Iso H, Jacobs DR, Jr, Goldman L: Accuracy of death certificate diagnosis of intracranial hemorrhage and nonhemorrhagic stroke. The Minnesota Heart Survey. Am J Epidemiol 1990; 132: 993-98
30. Boyle CA, Dobson AJ: The accuracy of hospital records and death certificates for acute myocardial infarction. Aust N Z J Med 1995; 25: 316-23
31. MacMahon S, Peto R, Cutler J et al: Blood pressure, stroke, and coronary heart disease. Part 1, Prolonged differences in blood pressure: prospective observational studies corrected for the regression dilution bias. Lancet 1990; 335: 765-74
32. Davis CE, Rifkind BM, Brenner H, Gordon DJ: A single cholesterol measurement underestimates the risk of coronary heart disease. An empirical example from the Lipid Research Clinics Mortality Follow-up Study. JAMA 1990; 264: 3044-46

## Index Copernicus

## Global Scientific Information Systems for Scientists by Scientists

TM

## www.IndexCopernicus.com



EVALUATION \& BENCHMARIKING
PROFILED INFORMATION
NETWORKING \& COOPERAIION
VIRTUAL RESEARCH GROUPS
GRANIS
PAIENTS
CLINICAL TRIALS

## JOBS

STRAITEGC \& FINANCIAL DECISIONS

## Index

## Copernicus integrates

## IC Journal Master List

Scientific literature database, including abstracts, full text, and journal ranking. Instructions for authors available from selected journals.

## IC Conferences

Effective search tool for worldwide medical conferences and local meetings.

## IC Scientists

Effective search tool for collaborators worldwide. Provides easy global networking for scientists. C.V.'s and dossiers on selected scientists available. Increase your professional visibility.

## IC Patents

Provides information on patent registration process, patent offices and other legal issues. Provides links to companies that may want to license or purchase a patent.

## IC Grant Awareness

Need grant assistance? Step-by-step information on how to apply for a grant. Provides a list of grant institutions and their requirements.

## IC Virtual Research Groups [VRG]

Web-based complete research environment which enables researchers to work on one project from distant locations. VRG provides:
(8) customizable and individually self-tailored electronic research protocols and data capture tools,
(82 statistical analysis and report creation tools,
(82) profiled information on literature, publications, grants and patents related to the research project,
(2) administration tools.

## IC Lab \& Clinical Trial Register

Provides list of on-going laboratory or clinical trials, including research summaries and calls for co-investigators.

